SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

This Settlement Agreement (Agreement) is entered into by and between the California Air Resources Board (ARB), with its principal office at 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California, CVS Pharmacy, Inc. (CVS) with its principal place of business at One CVS Drive, Woonsocket, Rhode Island, and Garcoa Laboratories, Inc. (Garcoa) with its principal place of business at 26135 Mureau Road, Suite 100, Calabasas, California.

RECITALS

1. ARB alleges that from January 2011 to September 2013, CVS sold, supplied, and offered for sale in California **CVS Pharmacy Skin Purifying Astringent** product (a CVS branded product) which was subject to the volatile organic compound (VOC) limit for "Astringent/Toner" category in Title 17, California Code of Regulations (CCR), section 94509(a).

2. ARB alleges Garcoa manufactured **CVS Pharmacy Skin Purifying Astringent** as a private label for CVS.

3. ARB alleges that **CVS Pharmacy Skin Purifying Astringent** product contained concentrations of VOCs exceeding the 35 percent VOC limit for astringent products specified in Title17, CCR, section 94509(a).

4. ARB alleges that if the allegations described in recital paragraphs 1, 2, and 3 were proven, civil penalties could be imposed against CVS and Garcoa as provided in Health and Safety Code Sections 42402 et seq. for each and every unit involved in the violations.

5. CVS admits the allegations described in recital paragraphs 1 and 2, but deny any liability resulting from said allegations. Garcoa admits the allegations described in recital paragraphs 2 and 3, but deny any liability resulting from said allegations.

6. The parties agree to resolve this matter completely by means of this Agreement, without the need for formal litigation.

Therefore, the parties agree as follows:

TERMS AND CONDITIONS

1. CVS and Garcoa shall not knowingly sell, supply, offer for sale, or manufacture for sale in California, any consumer products in violation of ARB consumer products regulations set forth in Title 17, CCR, Section 94500 et seq. however, the terms and conditions set forth in this agreement will remain valid and enforceable notwithstanding any future violations that may occur.

2. Garcoa in settlement of the above-described violations of Title17, CCR, section 94509(a) agrees to pay a penalty to ARB in the amount of $9,750.00 payable to the California Air Pollution Control Fund, within ten (10) days of the execution of this Agreement.

3. This settlement shall apply to and be binding upon CVS, Garcoa, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this settlement.

4. The parties stipulate that this Agreement shall be the final resolution of ARB claims regarding the above-described violations and shall have the same res judicata effect as a judgment in terms of acting as bar to any civil action by ARB against CVS, Garcoa, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations. This Agreement shall be deemed the recovery of civil penalties for purposes of precluding subsequent criminal action as provided in Health and Safety Code section 42400.7(a).

5. This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice of law rules.

6. This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB, CVS and Garcoa concerning the claims and settlement in this Agreement, and this Agreement fully supersedes and replace any and all prior negotiations and agreement of any kind or nature, whether written or oral, between ARB, CVS and Garcoa concerning these claims.

7. No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, shall be valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.

8. Each of the undersigned represents and warrants that he or she has full power and authority to enter into this Agreement.

9. **SB 1402 Statement**. California Health and Safety Code (HSC) section 39619.7 (Senate Bill 1402 - Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks. This Settlement Agreement includes this information, which is also summarized here.

   The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.

   The penalty provision being applied in this case is HSC section 42402, et seq. because CVS and Garcoa, supplied, offered for sale, or manufactured for sale consumer products for commerce in California in violation of the Consumer

Products Regulations (Title 17 California Code of Regulations (CCR) section 94507, et seq.). The penalty provisions of HSC section 42402, et seq. apply to violations of the Consumer Products Regulations because the regulations were adopted under authority of HSC section 41712 which is in Part 4 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code. The penalty provisions of HSC section 42402, et seq. apply to requirements adopted pursuant to Part 4.

The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including aggravating and mitigating factors and per unit or per vehicle basis for the penalty.

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. ARB considered all relevant circumstances in determining penalties, including the eight factors specified in HSC section 42403.

Under HSC section 42402, et seq. the penalty for strict liability violations of the Consumer Product Regulations are a maximum of $1,000 per day violation, with each day being a separate violation. In cases like this involving unintentional first time violations of the Consumer Products Regulations, the ARB has sought and obtained penalties of approximately $20,000.00 per ton of excess emissions of volatile organic compounds attributable to the violation. This represents an average cost to retire a ton of volatile organic compound emission credits and reformulate a product to comply with the Consumer Product Regulations. In this case the total penalty is $9,750.00 and there were 0.62 tons of excess VOC's attributable to the violation. This represents a penalty of approximately $15,000.00 per ton of excess emissions plus the cost of investigating the violation. The penalty in this case was reduced because Garcoa has not had previous violations, made diligent efforts to comply and cooperated with the investigation. The penalty was not enhanced because the previous settlements with CVS involved violations that occurred more than 5 years earlier or involved a separate distribution company from CVS. Penalties in future cases might be higher or larger on a per unit basis.

Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of the excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.

The Consumer Product Regulations do not prohibit emissions above a specific level, but they do limit the concentration of VOCs in regulated products. In this case a quantification of the excess emissions attributable to the violations was practicable because CVS and Garcoa made the product formulation and sales data necessary to make this quantification available to ARB. Based upon this information (which CVS and Garcoa have designated as confidential), the violations were calculated to have caused 0.62 tons of excess emissions of volatile organic compounds to be emitted to the atmosphere in California.

10. CVS and Garcoa acknowledge that ARB has complied with SB1402 in investigating and settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC section 42403, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty amount is being assessed and had considered and determined that while this penalty is not being assessed a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level, it is practicable for ARB to quantify the excess emissions from the alleged violations, has done so and has included this information in this Settlement Agreement.

11. Final penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar negotiated cases, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. The penalty reflects violations extending over a number of days resulting in quantifiable harm to the environment considered together with the complete circumstances of this case listed above. The penalty was discounted in this matter based on the factors described. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per ton basis.

12. The final penalty in this case was based in part on confidential business information provided by CVS and Garcoa that is not retained by ARB in the ordinary course of business. The penalty in this case was also based on confidential settlement communications between ARB, CVS, and Garcoa that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business either. The penalty also, reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against CVS and Garcoa, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that CVS and Garcoa may have secured from its actions.

CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD

Dated: 2/10/15

By: _____
James R. Ryden, Chief
Enforcement Division

CVS PHARMACY, INC.

Dated: _____

By: _____

Name: _____

Title: _____

GARCOA LABORATORIES, INC.

Dated: 2/2/15

By: _____

Name: Gregory A. Robin

Title: CEO

CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD

Dated: _____

By: _____
James R. Ryden, Chief
Enforcement Division

CVS PHARMACY, INC.

Dated: 8/13/14

By: Linda M. Cimbron

Name: Linda M. Cimbron
Assistant Secretary

Title: _____

GARCOA LABORATORIES, INC.

Dated: _____

By: _____

Name: _____

Title: _____